

Record of proceedings

8C

International Labour Conference - 109th Session, 2021

Date: 9 July 2021

World of Work Summit

Contents

	rage
High-level addresses	3
Address by His Holiness Pope Francis	3
Address by His Excellency Mr Moon Jae-in, President of the Republic of Korea	9
Address by His Excellency Mr António Costa, Prime Minister of Portugal	11
Address by His Excellency Mr Joseph Biden, President of the United States of America	13
Address by His Excellency Mr Félix-Antoine Tshisekedi Tshilombo, President of the Democratic Republic of the Congo	14
Conversation on global action for a human-centred COVID-19 response: Summary	15
High-level panel discussion on global action for a human-centred COVID-19 response: Summary	17

Thursday, 17 June 2021, 1 p.m. President: Mr Zniber

High-level addresses

The President

It is my great honour to welcome you all to the 2021 World of Work Summit, the theme of which is "Global action for a human-centred COVID-19 response".

In today's sitting, we have the honour to be addressed by a series of high-level dignitaries, beginning with His Holiness Pope Francis. Thereafter, four Heads of State or Government will also share their perspectives on the key issues facing the world of work.

These addresses will be followed by a conversation between Mr Guy Ryder, Director-General of the ILO, Mr Roberto Suárez Santos, Secretary-General of the International Organisation of Employers, and Ms Sharan Burrow, General Secretary of the International Trade Union Confederation, who will share with us their vision of the road to a human-centred recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic.

Address by His Holiness Pope Francis

Mr Ryder

Director-General of the International Labour Office and Secretary-General of the Conference (Original Spanish)

Today we are deeply honoured by the participation of His Holiness Pope Francis in our World of Work Summit.

Throughout its history, the ILO has forged partnerships with those who share its commitment to realizing social justice in and through the world of work. We have found allies in many places, including in faith-based organizations. And, from the encyclical *Rerum Novarum* of 1891 to Pope Francis' encyclical letter *Fratelli Tutti* of 2020 we have found in the social teaching of the Catholic Church strong commonalities with the social justice mandate of the ILO.

Pope Francis has condemned a prevailing culture of injustice and indifference that is at odds with the human meaning and function of work. He has spoken of the deficiencies of systems that produce growth and wealth along with acute poverty and inequality.

In *Fratelli Tutti*, Pope Francis presents solidarity as a way of making history, calls for authentic social dialogue to build a better way, and reminds us that social peace is hard work.

Today, as Government as well as Employers' and Workers' delegates gather virtually to commit to action for a human-centred recovery, I am certain that Pope Francis will inspire and guide us in our task of building a fair, inclusive and sustainable world of work.

His Holiness Pope Francis

(Original Spanish)

I thank the Director-General, Mr Guy Ryder, who has been so kind as to invite me to present this message to the World of Work Summit. This Conference is being held at a crucial moment in social and economic history, which presents serious and comprehensive challenges for the whole world. In the past few months, the International Labour Organization has, through its periodical reports, done commendable work and devoted special attention to our most vulnerable sisters and brothers.

During the persistent crisis, we should continue exercising special care for the common good. Many of the possible forecast upheavals have not yet come to pass and careful decisions are therefore needed. The reduction in working hours in the past few years has been translated both in terms of job losses and also a reduction in the working day for those who have kept their jobs. Many public services and companies have faced major difficulties, and some have run the risk of complete or partial bankruptcy. Throughout the world, in 2020 we have observed unprecedented job losses.

In a hurry to return to greater economic activity, let us avoid the past fixations on profit, isolationism and nationalism, blind consumerism and the negation of clear evidence which points to discrimination against our "expendable" sisters and brothers in our society. By contrast, let us seek solutions which help us to build a new future of work, based on decent and worthy working conditions, and on collective bargaining, and which promotes the common good, a basis which will make work an essential component of our care for society and creation. In that sense, work is truly and essentially human. This is the most important point, it should be human.

Recalling the fundamental role played by this Organization and this Conference as privileged forums for constructive dialogue, we are called upon to prioritize our response to the workers who are on the fringes of the world of work and who are still affected by the COVID-19 pandemic: low-qualified workers, labourers, those in the informal sector, migrant workers and refugees, those who do what is usually known as "3D work" that is dangerous, dirty and degrading, and so the list goes on.

Many migrants and vulnerable workers, together with their families, are normally excluded from access to national health promotion, disease prevention, treatment and care programmes, as well as financial protection plans and psychosocial services. This is one of the numerous cases of the disposal philosophy which we are used to imposing in our societies. This exclusion complicates early detection, the conduct of tests, diagnosis, contact tracing, and the search for medical care for COVID-19 for refugees and migrants, and therefore increases the risk that outbreaks occur among these population groups. Such outbreaks cannot be controlled or are even actively concealed, which constitutes an additional threat to public health.

The lack of social protection measures in the face of the impact of COVID-19 has given rise to an increase in poverty, unemployment, underemployment, the increase in the informal nature of work, the delay in integrating young people into the labour market, which is very serious, the increase in child labour, even more serious, vulnerability to people trafficking, food insecurity, and greater exposure to infection among the sick and elderly. In this sense, I welcome the opportunity to put forward a number of key concerns and observations.

First and foremost, it is the Church's essential mission to call on everyone to work together, with governments, multilateral organizations and civil society, to serve and care for the common good, and guarantee the participation of all in this undertaking. No-one should be left aside in a dialogue for the common good, the aim of which is, above all, to build, consolidate peace and trust among everyone. The most vulnerable the young, migrants, indigenous communities, the poor – cannot be left aside in a dialogue which should also bring together governments, employers and workers. It is also essential for all religious confessions and communities to make a joint commitment. The Church has broad experience of participation in these dialogues through its local communities, popular movements and organizations, and offers itself to the world as a builder of bridges to help to create the conditions for this dialogue or, where appropriate, to help to facilitate it. These dialogues for the common good are essential to achieve a sustainable future based on solidarity for our common home and should take place at the community, national and international level. Further, one of the characteristics of true dialogue is that those who participate in the dialogue are equal in terms of rights and duties. No dialogue should take place between a person who has fewer or greater rights and someone who has no rights. The same level of rights and duties thus quarantees a serious dialogue.

Second, it is also essential for the Church's mission to guarantee that everyone obtains the protection that they need, according to their vulnerabilities: ill-health, age, disabilities, displacement, marginalization or dependency. Social protection systems which, in turn, face significant risks, need to be supported and expanded to ensure access to health services, food and basic human needs. In times of emergency, such as the COVID-19 pandemic, special assistance measures are required. Special attention to the comprehensive and effective provision of assistance through public services is also important. Social protection systems have also been called upon to deal with many of the challenges of the crisis, at the same time as its weaknesses have become more obvious. Finally, protection for workers and the most vulnerable through respect for essential rights, including the right to form trade unions, must be guaranteed. In other words, forming a trade union is a right. The COVID-19 crisis has already affected the most vulnerable and they should not be adversely affected by the measures to speed up a recovery which focuses solely on economic indicators. That is to say, there is also a need to reform the economy, to conduct a comprehensive reform, in this regard. The means to promote the economy must be diverse and must also change.

At this time of reflection, when we are trying to establish our future action and give shape to a post-COVID-19 international agenda, we should pay special attention to the real danger of forgetting those who have been left behind. They run the risk of being attacked by a virus that is even worse than COVID-19: that of selfish indifference. In other words, a society cannot make progress by rejecting, it cannot move forward. This virus spreads with the thought that life is better, if it is better for me, and that everything will be well, if it is well for me, and thus a process begins and ends where one person is chosen instead of another, dispensing with the poor, sacrificing those left behind on the so-called "altar of progress". This is a whole dynamic based on elitism, which builds up new elites, at the cost of rejecting many people and many peoples.

Looking towards the future, it is essential for the Church, and therefore the action of the Holy See with the International Labour Organization, to support measures which remedy unfair or incorrect situations affecting labour relations, making them completely subordinate to the idea of exclusion, or infringing workers' fundamental rights. A threat is constituted by the theories which consider profit and consumption to be independent elements, or as autonomous variables of economic life, excluding workers and

determining their unbalanced standard of living. Today, this is all part of the game of competition and might is right, where the most powerful consumes the weakest. As a consequence of this situation, large masses of the population are excluded and marginalized: no work, no prospects, no way out.

The current pandemic has reminded us that there are no differences or borders between those who suffer. We are all fragile and, at the same time, all have great value. May we be shaken by what is happening around us. The time has come to eliminate the inequalities, to cure the injustice which is undermining the health of the whole human family. Faced with the agenda of the International Labour Organization, we must continue as we did previously in 1931, when Pope Pius XI, as a result of the Wall Street crisis and in the middle of the Great Depression, denounced the asymmetry between workers and employers as a blatant injustice which granted capital a free hand and made it available. He said that for a long time, wealth or "capital" had been assigned too often to themselves. Capital claimed for itself all the profit, the entire proceeds, leaving workers with barely what they needed to recover and rebuild their strength". Even in these circumstances, the Church promoted the position that the amount of remuneration for the work done must not only be intended to satisfy workers' immediate and current needs, but also to open up workers' capacity to safeguard their families' future savings or the investments capable of guaranteeing a margin of safety for the future.

Thus, since the first session of the International Labour Conference, the Holy See has supported uniform regulation applicable to labour in all its different aspects, as a guarantee for workers. Its belief is that labour, and therefore workers, may possess guarantees, support and empowerment, if they are protected from the game of deregulation. Furthermore, legal standards must be aimed at expanding employment, decent work, and the rights and duties of human beings. All these are measures necessary for their well-being, for comprehensive human development, and for the common good.

The Catholic Church and the International Labour Organization, responding to their different natures and functions, may continue applying their respective strategies, but may also carry on benefiting from the opportunities which present themselves for cooperating on a broad variety of relevant actions.

To promote this joint action, the term labour should be understood correctly. The first element of such an understanding requires us to focus the requisite attention on all forms of labour, including non-standard forms of employment. Labour goes beyond what has traditionally been known as formal employment, and the Decent Work Programme must include all forms of work. The lack of social protection for workers in the informal economy and for their families makes them particularly vulnerable to shocks, since they do not possess the protection offered by social security or poverty-oriented social welfare mechanisms. Women in the informal economy, including itinerant saleswomen and domestic workers, feel the impact of COVID-19 in many respects: from isolation to extreme exposure to health risks. Where accessible childcare is not available, the children of such working women are exposed to a greater health risk, since women have to take them to workplaces or leave them unprotected at home. It is therefore very necessary to guarantee that social welfare reaches the informal economy and pays special attention to the particular needs of women and children.

The pandemic reminds us that many women throughout the world continue to weep for freedom, justice and equality among all human beings: although there have been noticeable improvements in the recognition of women's rights and in their

participation in the public sphere, there is still much progress to be made in certain countries. Not all unacceptable customs have been eradicated: I highlight the shameful violence which is sometimes perpetrated against women, domestic ill-treatment and different forms of slavery. I am thinking of inequality in terms of access to worthy jobs and the places where decisions are taken.

The second element to understand labour correctly is that if labour is a relationship, the care dimension has to be incorporated in it, as no relationship can survive without care. We are referring here not only to care work: the pandemic reminds us of its fundamental importance, which we have perhaps neglected. Care goes further than that, it must be an aspect of all labour. Work which does not provide care, which destroys creation, which endangers the survival of future generations, does not respect the dignity of workers and may not be considered decent. By contrast, work which provides care, which contributes to the restoration of complete human dignity, will help to ensure a sustainable future for future generations. And, above all, this dimension of care comprises workers. In other words, one question which we may ask ourselves on a daily basis is how does a company, let us imagine, care for its workers?

In addition to understanding the term labour correctly, emerging stronger from the current crisis will require a culture of solidarity to be developed, in contrast to the culture of rejection which is the root cause of inequality and which afflicts the world. To achieve this aim, there will be a need to assess the contribution of all those cultures, such as indigenous and popular cultures, which are often considered to be marginal, but which keep the practice of solidarity alive, which expresses much more than certain sporadic acts of generosity. Each people has its culture, and I believe that this is the time to free ourselves for good of the legacy of the Enlightenment, which raised the word culture to the level of a certain type of intellectual training or membership of a society. Each people has its culture and we must accept it as it is. It is a question of thinking and acting in terms of community, of priority for the life of everyone over the appropriation of assets by a small few. It is also a question of fighting the structural causes of poverty, inequality, a shortage of jobs, land and housing, and the negation of social and labour rights. It is a question of tackling the destructive effects of the dominion of wealth. Solidarity, in the most profound sense of the term, is a way of making history and that is what popular movements are doing.

With these words, I turn to you, the participants in the 109th Session of the International Labour Conference, since, as institutionalized actors in the world of work, you have a great opportunity to influence the processes of change, which are already in motion. You have a great responsibility, but even greater is the benefit that you can bring. I therefore invite you to rise to the challenge which we are facing. The established actors may possess the legacy of their history, which continues to act as a resource of fundamental importance but, in this historical phase, we are required to remain open to the dynamism of society and to promote the appearance and inclusion of less traditional and more marginal actors who are the bearers of alternative and innovative impulses.

I request political leaders and those who work for governments to take their inspiration permanently from this form of love which is political charity: an equally essential act of charity is the effort designed to organize and structure society so that others do not have to endure poverty. It is charity to accompany a person who is suffering, and everything that is done to change the social conditions which cause that person's suffering, without even having direct contact with him or her, is also charity. If someone helps an elderly person to cross a river, and that is the highest form of charity, a politician builds a bridge for him or her, and that is also charity. If someone helps

another person with food, a politician creates a source of employment for him or her, and exercises the highest form of charity which ennobles his or her political action.

I remind the employers of their true vocation: to generate wealth for the benefit of all. Entrepreneurial activity is essentially a noble vocation designed to generate wealth and to improve the world for everyone. God promotes us and hopes that we develop the capacities which he gave us, and he filled the universe with different forms of potential. In his or her designs, each person is required to promote his or her own progress, and this includes promoting the economic and technological capacities leading to the growth of assets and wealth creation. However, in any case these capacities possessed by employers, which are a gift from God, should be directed clearly towards developing other people and overcoming poverty, especially by creating diversified sources of labour. Together with the right to private property, this is always the most important and leading principle of subordinating all private property to the universal destiny of the wealth of the earth and therefore the right of all to use it. At times, when we speak of private property, we forget that this is a secondary right, which depends on this primary right, that is the universal destiny of wealth.

I invite trade unionists and the leaders of workers' associations not to allow themselves to be locked in a straitjacket, so that they focus on the specific situations of the districts and communities in which they operate, putting forward simultaneously issues related to broader economic policies and macrorelations. Also in this historical phase, the trade union movement is facing two transcendental challenges. The first challenge is that of prophecy and is related to the specific nature of trade unions, their most authentic vocation. Trade unions are an expression of the prophetic profile of society. Trade unions are born and reborn whenever they, in the same way as biblical prophets, give a voice to those that do not have one, denounce those that would sell a poor person for next to nothing, as the prophet says, strip bare the powerful who trample on the rights of the most vulnerable workers and defend the cause of foreigners, the latter group and the rejected. It is clear that where a trade union is corrupted, this already cannot be done, and is transformed into a status of pseudo-boss who is also cut off from the people.

The second challenge is innovation. The prophets are sentries who are watching from their observation posts. Trade unions must also watch over the walls of the city of labour, just as a guard who watches over and protects those who are inside the city of labour, but who also watches over and protects those who are outside the walls. Trade unions do not perform their essential function of social innovation, if they watch over only retired persons. This has to be done, but it is only one half of their work. Their vocation is also to protect those who still have no rights, those who are excluded from working and that are also excluded from rights and democracy.

Distinguished participants in the tripartite processes of the International Labour Organization and this session of the International Labour Conference, the Church supports you and walks by your side. The Church places its resources at your disposal, beginning with its spiritual resources and its social doctrine. The pandemic has taught us that we are all in the same boat and that only together will we manage to emerge from the crisis.

Address by His Excellency Mr Moon Jae-in, President of the Republic of Korea

Mr Ryder

Director-General of the International Labour Office and Secretary-General of the Conference

It is my great honour and pleasure to introduce His Excellency Mr Moon Jae-in, President of the Republic of Korea. A Member of the ILO since 1991, the Republic of Korea has, under the leadership of President Moon, demonstrated particular commitment to promoting respect for fundamental principles and rights at work. As a result, this year the Republic of Korea ratified the key international labour Conventions on freedom of association, on the right to collective bargaining and on the prohibition of forced labour. In the face of COVID-19, the Republic of Korea has taken strong, purposeful and collective action and is now sharing its achievements and experience. It is committed to supporting developing countries to overcome the impact of the pandemic. We are very much encouraged by President Moon's advocacy for solidarity, cooperation, multilateralism and inclusiveness in fighting COVID-19 as well as with coexistence and a new prosperity, and we look forward very much to hearing his address.

Mr Moon

President of the Republic of Korea (Original Korean)

I am grateful for the ILO's efforts to pursue a human-centred recovery from the COVID-19 crisis and find it truly meaningful to join the World of Work Summit as a representative of the Asia and the Pacific region. For the past century, the ILO has helped people to work in freedom and dignity and enjoy economic stability and equal opportunities, and stood at the forefront of creating jobs and advancing workers' fundamental rights. Even in the course of overcoming the COVID-19 crisis, it called for an inclusive recovery through social dialogue by holding the Global Summit last year with tripartite delegates. I hope that at today's summit, convened to safeguard the value of labour and create a "world with work", we will pool our wisdom and forces to prevent inequalities of work in the post-COVID-19 era.

Labour is a source that keeps us alive. A job that gives us work is a foundation that sustains our life. It is through labour that we connect to one another in society, self-actualize and find life's worth and meaning. The world has increased the quantity and quality of jobs through economic development. Workers have advanced their rights and the value of labour through struggle. The Declaration of Philadelphia in 1944 that urged full employment and the raising of standards of living still resonates in many people's hearts. Job creation has now become a universal key policy objective. I myself have done my utmost to create more quality jobs from the very early days of my term because I believe a job is the engine of growth and the best form of welfare. The Korean Government has overhauled various tax systems and budget programmes to help create more jobs. It has reduced long working hours, and dramatically increased the minimum wage, seeking inclusive and income-led growth. Moreover, we have ratified ILO fundamental Conventions through social dialogue, sought to bring informal workers into the formal economy, reduced disparities in the labour market and moved toward a society that respects labour one step at a time.

However, last year the entire world was struck by the global pandemic. It was our work and jobs that were hardest hit. More than 100 million people lost their jobs across the world. If you consider the impact of restricted operating hours and the reduction of working hours, over 250 million full-time jobs disappeared. We were hit multiple times harder by the pandemic than by the global financial crisis. A bigger problem is that the employment crisis is more brutal on the vulnerable. Young people entering the labour market for the first time, women working in in-person service industries and temporary and daily workers with little protection were the first to be hit by the crisis. Although the global economy is recovering with the supply of vaccines across the world, the job crisis is ongoing. Considering that employment lags behind the economy, difficult times in the labour market could persist for quite some time. It is therefore high time that we join the ILO in its efforts to pursue a human-centred recovery while securing jobs.

We have to overcome the current crisis swiftly and return to normal. However, the recovery should not stop at one person, one business or one country. Only when every person, every business and every country recovers from the crisis can we secure jobs and prevent inequalities from worsening. The key to overcoming the economic hardships wrought by COVID-19 - the contraction of in-person business, loss of jobs and income, inequalities – is an inclusive job recovery. It is vitally important that we protect workers from the transformative changes already happening in the labour market. This is the essence of the "human-centred recovery" promoted by the ILO, the only kind that is sustainable and resilient. Such a recovery cannot be achieved by the efforts of one single economic entity. Nor can it be left to the market alone. We are at a critical juncture where we have to practice the ILO Centenary Declaration – a tripartite commitment to decent work for all. Korea was one of the first countries hit by COVID-19, but the Korean people became main actors of infectious disease control measures and we were able to balance our daily lives with control measures while keeping our neighbours safe in the spirit of solidarity and cooperation. Korea also demonstrated the spirit of solidarity and cooperation, sharing and inclusiveness, when tackling the job crisis. In July last year, when our economy and employment shrank considerably, workers' and employers' representatives were able to save jobs because they chose leave of absence and shorter working hours over lay-offs. Korea has consistently worked to spread a mutually beneficial local jobs model, whereby workers and businesses, local residents and governments create new jobs through concessions and cooperation.

Among various examples, the Gwangju Win-Win Regional Job Project made a notable achievement even during the coronavirus crisis, building the first finished vehicle assembly plant in Korea in over 23 years. An Agreement on Mutually Beneficial Job Creation was signed in eight different regions; workers, employers and local governments have worked hand in hand to overcome the job crisis, creating some 130,000 jobs worth a total of US\$46 billion. The Government has been actively backing their efforts as well. In order to share companies' labour costs, we dramatically expanded employment retention subsidies. Furthermore, by financing jobs for the underprivileged, we are making sure that the public sector shores up the job market. The unemployed are now better protected, with unemployment assistance and universal employment insurance. Welfare benefits go to a wider population, with an end to family support obligation criteria for living allowances and the introduction of sickness allowances. We will continue to build stronger employment and social safety nets in order not to repeat past experience where crisis begets more inequalities.

When we overcome the current crisis and create more decent jobs in the process, we will be able to call it a real "human-centred recovery". The coronavirus is accelerating our transition to a digital and green economy and bringing new opportunities to the future of jobs. New services using data and networks are emerging in markets. With an increasing number of companies joining the low-carbon transition through environmental, social and governance management, jobs are rapidly being created in new technology and industry areas. In order to rise to the challenges posed in the post-COVID-19 era and turn them into opportunities, Korea is implementing the Korean New Deal that invests US\$140 billion in related industries. We aim to create 1.9 million new jobs by 2025 in digital and green industries. In the face of increasingly rapidly changing economic and social structures, we will work to achieve a transition to a fairer society so that every member can enjoy opportunities of better jobs. By cultivating competent talents in software, artificial intelligence and green technology, we will shore up the growth of new industries. By revamping job-training programmes and providing better public employment services, we will help people to move smoothly to new jobs.

Various new forms of employment relationship, such as platform work, are spreading in the process of creating new jobs. There is an increasing need for us to complement the existing labour protection system that draws a strict line between employees and employers. For the past century, we have striven to expand workers' rights by establishing international labour standards. I hope that we continue to work together, with the ILO playing a central role, to find a solution that will turn our efforts into concrete achievements.

In the midst of the unprecedented global health crisis, we could minimize the loss of our daily lives by depending on each other's work. The coronavirus has paradoxically reminded us of the value of those who work in the areas that went unnoticed. We now call them "essential workers". Each country is beginning to awaken to the fact that improving the treatment of essential workers is in the interests of the entire community. Nevertheless, what we are doing is far from enough. A human-centred recovery starts from giving fair credit to labour and working together to create jobs that are more decent. Only through a "human-centred recovery" can we build a "people-centred economy". Let us put people at the centre as we overcome the COVID-19 crisis and create better jobs, and embark on a path of solidarity and cooperation, sharing and inclusiveness.

Address by His Excellency Mr António Costa, Prime Minister of Portugal

Mr Ryder

Director-General of the International Labour Office and Secretary-General of the Conference

It is now my very great pleasure to introduce His Excellency Mr António Costa, Prime Minister of the Republic of Portugal. Portugal was a founding member of our Organization, and the partnership with the ILO has gone from strength to strength over the years, anchored in Portugal's very strong commitment to the ILO's principles and values. We have appreciated and benefited from Portugal's solidarity as a partner in our development cooperation programme – an important channel for providing services to constituents. Prime Minister Costa's participation today is further testimony to Portugal's attachment to the ILO, to the United Nations and to multilateralism. During Portugal's presidency of the Council of the European Union in the first half of this year,

Prime Minister Costa helped steer the EU to lay the foundations for a recovery from the crisis that is based on social justice, with a key role for social dialogue. We have been encouraged by his vision of Europe's recovery from the crisis and of a fair, green and digital Europe for the future. In this regard, the action plan for the implementation of the European Pillar of Social Rights, adopted recently at the Porto Social Summit, reflects very closely the commitments of the ILO's own Centenary Declaration and the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. We are now very honoured to hear from Prime Minister Costa.

Mr Costa Prime Minister of Portugal (Original Portuguese)

I would like to begin by thanking the Secretary-General, Mr Guy Ryder, for organizing this summit and for inviting me to participate.

The pandemic has obviously had a brutal impact on health, with millions of deaths, and billions of people infected. However, there have also been other consequences on our society. As Mr Ryder said himself in the report he submitted to the Conference, "The pandemic has laid bare with unbearable brutality the realities of the multiple and growing inequalities in our societies, which, for the most part, have roots in the world of work".

The duality within the labour market was clearly exposed as a result. On the one hand, there are people in typical, relatively stable working relationships, for whom employment protection or unemployment protection proved particularly effective. In the European Union, for example, important instruments adopted on the basis of programmes such as Temporary Support to mitigate Unemployment Risks in an Emergency (SURE) and Recovery Assistance for Cohesion and the Territories of Europe (REACT-EU) were able to finance measures such as lay-offs in Portugal or short-time work, such as *Kurzarbeit* in Germany and reduced working time in Spain, which helped to protect jobs in businesses whose activities were paralysed due to the pandemic.

On the other hand, however, COVID has laid bare the multiple forms of precarity and informality, where the traditional models of protection have been ineffective. It has affected primarily the most vulnerable, such as informal workers, the young, migrants and women. Those people fell through the net of employment protection and unemployment protection and were particularly fragile. Combating precarious work is therefore fundamental for defending human dignity and also for the ensuring the resilience of society. If we look back historically at the people infected and at the epidemiological situation of COVID-19, we can see that it is precisely these people, the ones with the least protection – often the frontline and essential workers – whose health was most impacted by the pandemic. That is why the regulation of temporary work is absolutely essential and should be at the forefront of our agenda for decent work with labour rights throughout the years to come. Regulation is needed both for temporary work within companies and also for those working for temporary employment agencies.

Moreover, the pandemic has accelerated the process of digitalization. This has revealed opportunities but also weaknesses. Telework has developed greatly, as have distance learning and telemedicine. Digital tools clearly give us greater flexibility in our social lives and enable us to keep in touch with each other. Without them, we would have been even more isolated. However, we can also see the limits of these opportunities and the challenges they pose in terms of labour law. That is why we must ensure that the

regulation of telework, and particularly of digital platform work, is on our agenda for the near future. Similarly, it is also critical to invest in the skills, reskilling and upskilling of workers so that they can rapidly adapt to the new digital tools.

The Porto Social Summit was a cornerstone of our presidency of the Council of the European Union. There, we took an historic step in securing, for the first time, a broadened commitment among the social partners, Member States and EU institutions on support for the EU plan of action to implement the European Pillar of Social Rights, with concrete goals and quantified targets. One of those will be decisive for the future of work: ensuring that 60 per cent of workers participate in training activities at least once a year for the next ten years.

Decent work with labour rights is indeed fundamental for human dignity. But it is also indispensable in making our society more resilient and better able to cope with crises such as the pandemic. Nobody wished for this pandemic, but we must all attempt to learn lessons from it.

Address by His Excellency Mr Joseph Biden, President of the United States of America

Mr Ryder

Director-General of the International Labour Office and Secretary-General of the Conference

I am honoured now to introduce His Excellency Mr Joseph Biden, President of the United States of America. President Biden is the third President of the United States to address the International Labour Conference since his country became a Member of the ILO in 1934. In 1941, President Franklin Roosevelt described the creation of the ILO as a wild dream made a reality and, in 1999, President Bill Clinton addressed the Conference session which adopted the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, the only Convention to have ever achieved universal ratification. President Biden has signalled strong commitment to labour and to employment issues, guided by considerations of decency and justice in both domestic and international policy and with the imperative of building back better. Today, we thank President Biden for his message of encouragement to continue to strive for the realization of the ILO's values and principles. We appreciate his commitment to the ILO and for his taking the time to deliver this message of support that offers a very firm foundation for a reinforced and invigorated partnership. We will now hear President Biden's message.

Mr Biden

President of the United States of America

I want to thank the International Labour Organization for everything it does, just as it did when this Organization was founded a century ago.

Democracy faces another test now. The autocrats of the world believe democracy cannot compete in the twenty-first century. They became emboldened and now they are coming after the rights of workers and international labour standards that have long identified the ILO. They are betting we cannot come through for working people, but they are wrong. As we emerge from this pandemic that has exacerbated inequity and put even greater strain on working families, we have to prove that democracy can deliver, and we do that by empowering workers, raising wages, standing up for union rights, holding bad actors everywhere accountable when they subject their citizens to

forced labour or child labour, even as they seek positions of global leadership, and centring workers in our trade policy, and building economies that bring everyone along. Autocrats cannot build the strong inclusive economies we all seek; they will not, and they will not win the future as a consequence. Democracies will. America stands with you as we work to deliver good jobs with dignity and a strong equitable economy.

Address by His Excellency Mr Félix-Antoine Tshisekedi Tshilombo, President of the Democratic Republic of the Congo

Mr Ryder

Director-General of the International Labour Office and Secretary-General of the Conference (Original French)

It is a great pleasure for me to introduce His Excellency, Mr Félix-Antoine Tshisekedi Tshilombo, President of the Democratic Republic of the Congo and President in office of the African Union. I thank His Excellency for his participation today.

The ILO attaches particular importance to the natural and strategic partnership which connects it with the Democratic Republic of the Congo. We support the tripartite mandates in the priority areas of social security, youth employment, social dialogue and international labour standards. We also welcome the Government's efforts to combat the health, social and economic consequences of the pandemic.

African countries have been confronted in a different manner with the impact of the COVID-19 crisis and I would like to congratulate the African Union, the current president of which is the Democratic Republic of the Congo, on its achievements during the pandemic, such as the COVID-19 continent-wide strategy. The ILO remains a close partner of the African Union and I am confident that, under the leadership of His Excellency, the African Union will be well placed to make the post-COVID-19 recovery a human-centred one, based on values of social justice, and responding to the needs of populations, in particular young African women and young African men.

Mr Tshisekedi TshilomboPresident of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (Original French)

I am delighted to be here with you today to participate in this important activity which is an integral part of the 109th Session of the International Labour Conference which, this year, is exceptionally being held remotely. It is devoted to the response to the COVID-19 pandemic and to building a better world of work.

I would like first and foremost to express my compassion to all the victims of this pandemic. At the same time, all my thoughts are with the women and men, in particular medical workers and those in related professions, who are on the front line in the fight against this disease.

The world of work has been, and remains, seriously affected by this crisis. According to the statistics produced by the International Labour Organization, millions of full-time jobs have been lost.

In Africa, the consequences of this disease are being felt particularly in social and economic terms. They are therefore accentuating vulnerability and poverty. African States are working to improve access to healthcare and assistance for vulnerable people

as well as to promote entrepreneurship, taking into account the opportunities offered to us by the digital sector. One of the priorities of the African Union in this period is to extend to all the segments of our populations effective social protection coverage.

As regards the Democratic Republic of the Congo, our action is human-centred: education as a key to change and the principal means of social development; "universal health coverage"; the promotion of decent employment and vocational training; and making women autonomous and promoting youth. The appointment of women to positions of responsibility in my government helps us to recognize the contribution made by them to wealth creation and decent employment. For the first time in its history, the Democratic Republic of the Congo has just appointed 27 per cent of women to its Government, as: Deputy Prime Minister; and Ministers of State, in key sectors including the environment, justice or the public administration.

In terms of strategic approaches against the COVID-19 pandemic, we must all remain clear-sighted and realistic in the hope of eradicating this global scourge. Our efforts must rather be focused on establishing solid labour-rights-protection mechanisms, reducing the risks relating to new technologies, the diversification of employment opportunities, in particular green jobs, and the strengthening of social protection mechanisms. To reach this level, greater solidarity and the exercise of joint efforts at the national, regional and international levels will allow us to overcome the COVID-19 pandemic and its consequences.

My country, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, and Africa as a whole, stand ready to support the response to the health emergency.

It is clearly necessary to invest in research, strengthening healthcare systems and also to support the focused international coordination effort to preserve jobs and income with a view to guaranteeing social well-being.

Conversation on global action for a human-centred COVID-19 response: Summary

The Director-General, asked the two interlocutors, Ms Sharan Burrow (General Secretary of the international Trade Union Federation) and Mr Roberto Suárez-Santos (Secretary-General of the International Organisation of Employers) to reflect on the key messages conveyed by the high-level speakers, and how those messages could inform the COVID-19 response and recovery effort.

Ms Burrow highlighted the common themes in the messages delivered, which centred on the need for a just, resilient and human-centred recovery from the COVID-19 crisis, and said that the ILO had a central role to play in that effort. The messages had reinforced the aspects of a new social contract needed to promote dignity of labour. Social protection was essential in that regard, particularly for the large number of workers in the informal economy. There could be no resilience in recovery unless people were afforded a certain level of social protection. Global solidarity was required to overcome the challenges facing the labour market. Jobs plans were needed in every country. Overcoming persistent inequalities in the world of work, moreover, was a prerequisite for achieving shared prosperity and realizing the ambition of full employment, which in turn was essential for achieving Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 8. The ILO Centenary Declaration for the Future of Work was a statement of the commitment required to establish a new social contract.

Mr Suárez-Santos underscored the message of unity of purpose that had been conveyed by the high-level speakers and said he shared the view that ILO constituents had been brought closer together during the pandemic. The crisis had also revealed that former ways of working had not yielded the desired results, as evidenced by the increasing number of workers in the informal economy and in child labour. In addition, insufficient progress had been made in extending social protection. Fundamental principles and rights at work must be strengthened. The creation of decent jobs required a favourable environment for sustainable enterprises, anchored in the Decent Work Agenda. The ILO's support was required to shape an appropriate business environment for the future. An agenda to promote productivity and skills development was necessary to enable workers to transition from the informal to the formal economy.

The Director-General asked, in view of the increase in child labour and working poverty, whether the notion of building back better was indeed realistic, and if so, how it could be achieved.

Ms Burrow restated that a human-centred recovery from the COVID-19 crisis would require broad will to realize the commitments set forth in the various ILO declarations, adopted over the years. A social contract that valued work, full employment and respect for fundamental rights, as called for by the ILO Centenary Declaration, would be critical.

Mr Suárez-Santos echoed the need for broad will and commitment to build back better; the future of workplaces and the way businesses operated would be different. The opportunities afforded by that change should be explored, and new capacities built accordingly.

Lastly, **the Director-General** enquired what the current sentiments and outlook were among workers' and employers' organizations at the global level in the wake of the pandemic.

Ms Burrow confirmed that organized labour at the global level remained fully committed to a new social contract with the ambition of seeing the creation of decent jobs. To that end, workers and employers must be supported at the national level to engage with governments in making national plans to tackle persistent challenges in the world of work.

Mr Suárez-Santos said that the diversity of the global business community meant that sentiments among employers varied. Despite the clear sense of desperation throughout the pandemic, employers' organizations remained committed to promoting decent work and overcoming challenges in that regard, such as child labour. The ILO's support would be required to further strengthen the capacity of employers' organizations to find solutions through social dialogue.

The Director-General, in closing, emphasized that the COVID-19 crisis had brought into focus several aspects that needed to be changed and improved in the world of work.

(The Conference continues its work in plenary.)

Friday, 18 June 2021, 1 p.m.

High-level panel discussion on global action for a human-centred COVID-19 response: Summary

Moderator

Ms Femi Oke, journalist and presenter

Panellists

- Ms Luisa María Alcalde Luján, Secretary of Labour and Social Welfare, Mexico
- Ms Ana Mendes Godinho, Minister of Labour, Solidarity and Social Security, Portugal
- Mr Nimal Siripala de Silva, Minister of Labour, Sri Lanka
- Mr Adama Kamara, Minister of Employment and Social Protection, Côte d'Ivoire
- Mr Faroog Ahmed, Secretary-General and CEO, Bangladesh Employers' Federation
- Ms Toni Moore, General Secretary, Barbados Workers' Union
- Mr Mahmoud Mohieldin, Special Envoy of the United Nations Secretary-General on Financing the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development

The Director-General, setting the scene for the panel discussion, recalled the devastating impacts on the world of work of the COVID-19 crisis. He emphasized the importance of looking forward by setting an agenda for a human-centred recovery from the crisis, and highlighted that the International Labour Conference had adopted a global Call to Action outlining measures to drive a human-centred recovery from the pandemic. The time had come to move towards action; tripartite constituents would be central to that effort, with the support of the ILO.

A video was shown, illustrating the significant impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the world of work. The economic and social disruption caused by the pandemic had threatened the livelihoods of millions of people, especially the world's most vulnerable workers. International cooperation and social dialogue were needed more than ever to address the multiple crises caused by the pandemic. The ILO Centenary Declaration should serve as a road map in that regard.

The moderator invited all participants to take part in an online poll. They were asked, "In your experience, what has been the most significant impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the world of work?" The response options were:

- (a) increased unemployment;
- (b) greater inequalities;
- (c) innovation and new ways of working;
- (d) more tripartite and international cooperation.

The majority of respondents answered (a) increased unemployment, followed by (b) greater inequalities, (c) innovation and new ways of working, and lastly (d) more tripartite and international cooperation.

The moderator launched the discussion by asking the panellists to reflect on the lessons learnt from the COVID-19 crisis and its impacts.

Ms Mendes Godinho said that when the pandemic had struck, unemployment rates in Portugal had been at their lowest in 20 years. Crisis measures had therefore been prioritized to protect jobs and workers, particularly the most vulnerable. The Government had prioritized measures to ensure that households did not lose income during periods of school closure, when parents were obliged to stay at home, and had encouraged a balanced distribution of family care responsibilities between women and men. The pandemic had afforded an opportunity to learn how best to tackle challenges related to the informal market and the situation of vulnerable workers, in particular migrants, in times of crisis. The Portuguese Government aimed to maintain low unemployment rates, guaranteeing decent work both for workers "inside" and "outside" the system. Social security systems must cover those in new forms of work, such as teleworkers and atypical workers, and mechanisms for social dialogue mechanisms should be developed to include those workers.

The moderator invited Ms Alcalde Luján to comment on how the recent labour reform in Mexico had helped mitigate the employment impacts of the crisis.

Ms Alcalde Luján emphasized that the pandemic had shown that, to mitigate the employment impacts of the COVID-19 crisis, Mexico needed to transition away from economic and labour models that had fostered inequality to a more inclusive and sustainable, human-centred approach. Moreover, since 2019, Mexico had introduced reforms to bring trade unions and collective bargaining to the centre of its world of work. The pandemic had demonstrated the importance of that approach, which entailed heightened attention to trade union freedom and democracy. Trade unions must be attractive to younger workers and allow for greater freedom of association, to enable young people to participate actively in labour reform and in the transformation of Mexico's labour culture.

The moderator asked how the Government of Sri Lanka had been able to support migrant and informal economy workers during the pandemic.

Mr de Silva said that the Sri Lankan Government had implemented a series of control measures to prevent the spread of the disease. Resources had been identified to alleviate hardships, including health measures and cash transfers. A tripartite task force had been established to monitor the impact of the pandemic on the world of work and to conclude relevant agreements. Protection of vulnerable and informal economy workers had proven particularly challenging. The need to extend coverage of social protection systems to such groups was evident. A comprehensive mandatory insurance scheme for migrant workers was currently being developed.

The moderator asked how workers in the informal economy, in particular, had been affected by the COVID-19 crisis in Côte d'Ivoire.

Mr Kamara said that, for Côte d'Ivoire, the pandemic had hit at a time of significant economic growth, which had enabled the Government to put in place measures to mitigate the impact of the crisis on the economy and the population. A health response plan had been launched to slow the spread of the pandemic, and the Government had invested in the protection of production systems to protect employers against having to lay off workers and thereby safeguard workers' purchasing power. A solidarity fund had been set up for the most vulnerable.

The moderator invited Mr Ahmed to comment on the measures that had been introduced to support enterprises during the pandemic.

Mr Ahmed said that increased informalization, lack of skills and lower productivity were among the challenges that had affected businesses and disrupted supply chains. The situation had been exacerbated by a lack of coordination among key decision-making agencies in the public sector. To recover, innovative, sustainable and inclusive alternatives were needed, which supported skills diversity, change management and resilience. He urged governments and all stakeholders to work together with social partners in a coordinated manner.

The moderator invited Ms Moore to reflect on the challenges faced by trade unions and to share her views on the best way forward.

Ms Moore explained that COVID-19 had exacerbated inequalities: many workers, notably front line and essential workers who normally kept economies going, had felt the pandemic's impact through income losses. It was worrying that jobs at lower-income levels were lost at a faster rate than new opportunities for higher-income jobs were created. Workers were exposed to increasing demands for greater skills to access jobs. A coordinated effort was required to accelerate training and upskilling.

Stating that, globally, a staggering US\$16 trillion had been set aside to respond to the COVID-19 crisis, **the moderator** invited Mr Mohieldin to comment on the use of those funds, in particular whether they were being used equitably.

Mr Mohieldin stated that some member countries of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) had been able to spend more than 10 per cent of their gross domestic product (GDP) on pandemic response measures, whereas low- and middle-income countries had typically not been able to spend more than 2 per cent of their GDP. That situation was likely to reinforce inequalities. The prognosis for 2021 showed that economic growth in some countries and regions, such as the United States of America, China and Europe could reach 5–8 per cent. Lower and middle-income countries, however, would likely be reaching less than 3 per cent economic growth, much of which would not be associated with job creation. The pandemic had shown that countries that had not invested in infrastructure, human capital or resilience, for example in climate and social protection, were more vulnerable.

The moderator invited participants to answer the second question in the poll, "What do you think is the biggest priority for ensuring a human-centred recovery for the world of work?" The response options were:

- (a) a just transition to climate neutrality;
- (b) social protection;
- (c) transition from informality to formality;
- (d) investment in skills and lifelong learning;
- (e) more dialogue and cooperation.

The majority of respondents answered (b) social protection, followed by (d) investment in skills, (c) transition from informality to formality, (e) more dialogue and cooperation and lastly (a) just transition to climate neutrality.

The moderator invited Mr Mohieldin to reflect on how to secure financing for the many other issues on the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, beyond COVID-19.

Mr Mohieldin said that the global community was not on track to achieve the SDGs. While the pandemic had resulted in an income loss of some US\$3.7 trillion for workers around the world, the world's billionaires had accumulated a combined wealth of US\$3.9 trillion. The global financial system had some US\$100 trillion under asset management. Available finances must be channelled towards the priorities of inclusive growth and resilience. The starting point must be domestic budgets, rather than global finances. National tax systems should be able to mobilize resources for health, education and social protection. Businesses, investors and official development assistance (ODA) should then be called on to bridge the finance gap.

The moderator invited Ms Moore to reflect on how governments, employers and workers could use the COVID-19 experience to work better together.

Ms Moore said that the pandemic had highlighted the need for collective action at all levels, with dialogue and cooperation at the centre of a transformative agenda to bolster resilience. Consideration must be given to broadening the coverage of job creation strategies, education, training and social security systems. Dialogue and cooperation were needed to respond to challenges that had existed before the COVID crisis, and which had been exacerbated during the pandemic.

The moderator called on Mr Ahmed to comment on how enterprises could play a meaningful part in the efforts to build back better and build back greener.

Mr Ahmed explained that labour market policies needed to be adjusted with the support of tripartite coalitions to identify innovative policy responses. Investing in education would contribute to building the necessary skills for future digital and knowledge economies. Priority policy initiatives should include: a human-centred recovery, focused on innovation and technology for creating new opportunities for sustainable jobs and enterprises; efficient social protection systems; multilateralism; using the SDGs as a comprehensive framework for sustainable recovery; and promoting social dialogue and a gender-responsive recovery model.

The moderator said that young workers and employers had been hit hardest by the pandemic. She invited Mr Kamara to consider what measures could be taken to support such young people.

Mr Kamara said that the Government of Côte d'Ivoire had been focusing on youth employment well before the pandemic; a ministry responsible for youth employment issues had been in operation for six years. Youth unemployment, although a global problem, was especially prevalent in Africa. While harnessing the potential of young people was a significant opportunity for Africa, mechanisms were needed to give young people access to decent jobs or job creation opportunities. Young people could be encouraged to enter the manufacturing sector, including to support the manufacturing of products related to disease control. To promote entrepreneurship, affordable credit should be made available. If set up, the vaccination industry could also be a source of employment for young people. Côte d'Ivoire had established a programme entitled "Côte d'Ivoire Solidaire", which aimed to create 8 million jobs by 2030, targeting the agricultural sector in particular.

The moderator asked Mr de Silva to describe the work of the tripartite task force that he had chaired, which had been set up by the Government of Sri Lanka to address the employment crisis caused by the pandemic.

Mr de Silva said that the tripartite task force had been established to create greater understanding of the pandemic and its effects. It had facilitated a successful agreement on payment of wages to private sector employees, which had enabled workers to keep their jobs and had supported income flows. Another achievement had been an agreement on a minimum salary for private sector workers obliged by the pandemic to stay at home. Every decision of the task force had been reached through broad consultation.

The moderator expressed concern about the increasing number of workers in the informal economy and asked Ms Alcalde Luján to share her advice on how to rectify that situation.

Ms Alcalde Luján shared the example of how Mexico had taken steps to ensure that workers in the informal economy were not excluded from the healthcare system, which had been a major challenge at the start of the pandemic. Measures had been taken to allow everyone living in Mexico to access free healthcare services. A welfare system had also been introduced to support vulnerable groups, which had provided protection to 70 per cent of families in Mexico, thereby safeguarding the purchasing power of workers at the base of the social pyramid. The transition from informality to formality had also been encouraged through the establishment of a minimum wage, which had reduced inequalities, having benefited groups of workers that had generally been excluded from the formal economy, such as domestic workers, 90 per cent of whom were women.

The moderator invited Ms Mendes Godinho, since the Portuguese Presidency of the European Union (EU) was coming to an end, to reflect on how the EU would support efforts to build back better and create employment opportunities.

Ms Mendes Godinho highlighted the cooperation between EU Member States in responding to the crisis and supporting people in need. The EU Summit in Porto had resulted in a tripartite agreement among social partners, European institutions and civil society, which had emphasized the importance of the social dimension in all aspects of the recovery effort. The Summit had also agreed that financial resources would need to be aligned with the social dimensions of the recovery. €760 billion would be reinvested in European economies to support reskilling and jobs to ensure a just recovery. While that agreement constituted a tripartite commitment to support the social dimension of crisis recovery, each Member State had its own plans with specific goals to be reached by 2030.

The moderator asked how, as the world was moving from crisis to crisis, "building back better" could become a reality.

Ms Mendes Godinho stressed that financial resources must be aligned with solid structural change to build resilience and ensure crisis preparedness.

The moderator asked whether "building back better" was merely a slogan or if it would lead to action.

Ms Alcalde Luján said that the pandemic had provided an opportunity to create a more just society, with greater equity. Building back better should not be merely a slogan, but rather a true motto for all.

The moderator asked Mr de Silva what measures were needed at the national level to ensure greater alignment between macroeconomic stability and the creation of more and better jobs.

Mr de Silva replied that COVID-19 had added a new dimension to challenges that the world had already been facing. Governments, employers and workers must establish a pragmatic work schedule to deal with the challenges of the pandemic.

The moderator asked Mr Ahmed to share an example of a positive result of using social dialogue to formulate national COVID-19 response policies and crisis mitigation measures.

Mr Ahmed noted that social dialogue could be used to resolve a variety of challenges and to reach compromise on many issues. Social dialogue should therefore be promoted further in the face of the ongoing pandemic.

The moderator asked Mr Kamara for his views on the role of social dialogue in responding to the COVID crisis in Côte d'Ivoire.

Mr Kamara explained that social dialogue had supported consensus-building around several important issues and was an ongoing process.

The moderator returned to the slogans of "build back better" and "build back greener" and asked Ms Moore why the COVID-19 crisis was different from other crises.

Ms Moore said that the COVID-19 crisis had shed light on weaknesses in the existing system, and created an opportunity to build back sustainably, through a human-centred, inclusive approach.

The moderator asked Mr Mohieldin how social protection systems in developing countries could be financed, and whether an international monitoring mechanism could be established to ensure that finances would benefit investing in human capacities and skills.

Mr Mohieldin reiterated that financing needed to start at the national level. Governments must undertake a thorough assessment of the required budgets and structures of a social protection floor. Some countries might not have the required resources and would need to rely on development assistance. The ILO Centenary Declaration for the Future of Work echoed the importance of investing in people, institutions and decent work.

The moderator introduced an interactive word cloud exercise, whereby participants were invited to share their hopes for a human-centred recovery for the world of work by completing the following sentence: "The new normal in the world of work I want to see emerge from this crisis should be more _____".

The moderator thanked the panellists for their contributions and invited the Director-General to give his closing remarks.

The Director-General noted that the pandemic had resulted in a greater sense of vulnerability. The world was emerging from a feeling of fear. The agenda for a human-centred recovery was a broad agenda for action; the world needed something different from the policy agendas present before COVID-19. Slogans and strong consensus must be turned into sustainable action, nationally and internationally. Solidarity and internationalism were essential, and the necessary financial resources must be committed to make human-centred recovery a reality.

(The Conference continues its work in plenary.)